



Scottsdale Arts – Scottsdale Public Art Advisory Board
August 14, 2024, at noon
Mezzanine Conference Room (MCR)
7380 E. 2nd Street, Scottsdale, AZ 85251
Directions/Information: Scottsdale Public Art, 480-874-4640

MINUTES

Members Present: Spencer Bell*, Mark Carroll, Russell Grossman, Christine Kovach*, Leah Manbeck, Bryanna McHenry, Jeff Miller, Elan Mizrahi, Jaime Neuffer, Melody Salamo, Janet Sandino*, Anne Travous, Miho Schoettker*

*via Zoom

Members Excused Absent: Stephanie Lyon, Cassandra Saba

Members Unexcused Absence: None.

Staff Present: Kate Arford, Kati Ballares, Talia De La Garza, Tanya Galin, Jennifer Gill, Victoria Sajadi, Wendy Raisanen

Members of the Public Present: Barney Gonzales, Mayor David Ortega, Rachel Smetana

1. **CALL TO ORDER-** Meeting was called to order at 12:03 p.m.
2. **NEW BOARD MEMBER INTRODUCTIONS** – New board members Leah Manbeck, Spencer Bell, and Anne Travous introduced themselves to the board.
3. **CONSENT AGENDA-**
 - 3a. Consider Motion to Approve June 12, 2024, Minutes

Elan Mizrahi moved, seconded by Melody Salamo, to approve the consent agenda as amended. The motion passed unanimously.
4. **PUBLIC COMMENT**

Mr. Barney Gonzales attended the meeting to learn about the process of Public Art and express concerns about murals on the exterior of architecturally significant buildings such as the Scottsdale Museum of Contemporary Art.
5. **“Know Your Public Art” Trivia: LV III** by Bill Barrett

Board member Leah Manbeck will present trivia questions for the September meeting.
6. **CONFLICT OF INTEREST**

All board members were requested to sign and submit the 2024 SPA board member conflict of interest form.
7. **ORDINANCE AND PROCEDURE OVERVIEW**

Director of Public Art Kati Ballares gave an overview of the two different City of Scottsdale Ordinances, which are the policies that govern the program's operations. The Art in Public Places Ordinance is the percentage for art policy outlining the public art program integrated into public buildings and spaces. The Cultural Improvement program is the City's Planning Ordinance Code that outlines the Art in Private Development program, requiring developers in specific areas of Scottsdale to either integrate public art into their development plans or transfer the amount required to the City's Cultural Trust Fund to use in Public Art Projects in public spaces.

8. ACTION ITEMS

8a. Consider Motion to Approve changes to Remi Hotel (formerly The Maya) Stage 1 Art Plan – Tanya Galin, Public Art Manager

Tanya introduced Boyce O'Brien, Valerie Vadala Homer, Victoria Woronuk, and Hugh Hallman (Legal Representation for the developer) to present their proposal. Daniel Popper's sculpture *Tummo* (eternal fire), approved in March 2023, has already financially fulfilled the art requirement for the Remi Hotel. The sculpture is in fabrication and will be installed in the Fall of this year.

The proposal includes a ninety-foot by eighteen-foot dynamic art wall located on the south end of the west wall of the Remi Hotel. The intention of the digital display would provide a dynamic, changing presence 24/7, enhance pedestrian flow and wayfinding, and create dynamic art that engages pedestrians and visitors. They propose to work initially with an AZ-based artist, Ernest Roberts, with whom they have collaborated on previous projects for over 10 years. Programming for the work has not been established but will be specific to Scottsdale; examples shown were the artist's previous work. It is proposed to respond to the master plan goals of the project: create a destination attraction, enhance pedestrian flow and interest, help wayfinding, and define the character of the area. It will have a presence day and night, engaging visitors and pedestrians and being accessible 24/7. In the presentation, Valerie shared videos of 3D Animation examples and stated that the board would be used for various effects and changes depending on what is going on in Scottsdale and what is going on in the hotel.

The process for approving and enforcing the artwork displayed on the digital screen is not yet in place, including how many artworks are selected and how often the display changes. The developer would fund the project with an estimated budget of \$250,000. The estimated timeline is to pursue Stage 1 review & approval in July 2024, DRB review & approval in September, SPA Stage II review & approval in October, fabrication & preparation for installation in November, site prep & installation in December, and SPA Stage III Approval in January 2025.

Please see the attachment for detailed questions transcribed by board members and responses from the developer's team.

Jeff Miller made a motion, seconded by Elan Mizrahi, to discuss the item further in an executive session. Bryanna McHenry recused herself from discussing and voting. The motion passed unanimously.

8b. Consider Motion to Approve Collections Management Policy Draft – Kati Ballares, Director of Public Art, and Wendy Raisanen, Curator of Exhibitions and Collections

Kati reviewed the changes made to the Collections Management Policy Draft. The board agreed to table this action item until September after further changes are made.

9. UPDATES

9a. Canal Convergence update in September

9b. Scottsdale Stadium update in September

10. REPORT FROM THE CHAIR

- None.

11. REPORT FROM DIRECTOR

11a. Rachel Smetana was hired as CoS Director of Tourism and Events and is now the SPA liaison.

11b. Karen Churchard returns this month to CoS, collaborating with SPA on ordinance work.

11c. Tile Making Workshop with artist Kristine Kollasch at the September 11 meeting.

11d. Thanks to our summer Public Art intern, Kate Arford, for all her help this summer.

11e. A fall Public Art intern will begin in September to assist with data mapping and analytics.

11f. Tanya will present with Bollinger Atelier at Codaworx in Cincinnati in October.

12. BOARD OF TRUSTEES UPDATE

- None.

13. NEW/ADDITIONAL BUSINESS

- None.

14. **NEXT SPA BOARD MEETING:** September 11, 2024, at noon in the Mezzanine Conference Room, Scottsdale Center for the Performing Arts 7380 E. 2nd Street, Scottsdale, AZ 85251

15. **ADJOURNMENT OF MEETING:** Jaime Neuffer moved to adjourn the meeting at 1:17 p.m., which was seconded by Russell Grossman.

Attachment – Transcription of Questions and Responses from Remi Stage 1 Update presentation:

J. Neuffer - This is Jamie Neuffer, board member. Are the plans for this display to...because this is a display, right? It's a giant flat monitor display on the on the building, correct?

B. O.- Yes.

J. N.- Are there plans to just have artworks displayed on there, or is there also going to be advertising displayed on the board?

B. O.- There will be no advertising displayed on the board. It's intended to be art, not a billboard.

H. Hallman - Further than that, I'll say, in fact, the development agreement said relatively clear that this must be art. What the council approved in the development agreement defining it as art requires that it be within the confines of art. We've also, on a number of occasions, offered to the city to document an agreement to make sure that that Scottsdale Art participates in the creation of, let's see if we can do a little better job here, participates in the creation of, well, that's not working. Sorry that we're so far away from you, create and participate in the creation of what finally gets installed, and that would then be subject to your approval. The idea is that Scottsdale Arts becomes a dynamic partner in creating what goes there, recognizing we don't overwhelm you with a lot of obligations, but the idea is that we bring in the creativity from Scottsdale Arts and local artists.

E. Mizrahi - Okay, I have some questions, if you don't mind, you described the actual display as being a dynamic electronic wall monitor, wall mural, and I believe I just heard giant flat monitor display. I'm not really a tech person, but how does that distinguish itself from other electronic media, such as like a giant television screen or a giant electronic billboard?

H. H.- The technology that gets used has been changing over time. So, for example, look in Chicago, in the water installation in Centennial Park, you'll see a similar installation. If you've ever been to Chicago or seen that the technology keeps changing over time, as it does with our computers, we've gone from sort of digital displays to much more refined presentations. This particular installation is a technology that one would see in lots of those instances, but the result is the rendering that is ultimately a dynamic mural. Somebody seeing it would not have a sense of which technology is used, but just of the dynamism associated with mural presentation.

E. M.- So, if I can understand what you're saying, it sounds like what you're saying is that the result of what you're proposing, because it has an artistic component, makes it a dynamic, electronic wall mural, but the mechanics of what the display is essentially the same as large electronic screens that could display really anything. If it was in Times Square, it could display, you know, videos or advertising or anything like that, just in terms of the mechanics of what the item is, is that true or false?

H. H.- That is the case that if you had an art installation in an art gallery made with television screens, you'd be making the same point. This is, it's restricted in its use for art displays. And the way in which that's assured is that Scottsdale Arts participates in this process, and the development agreement limits it to art.

E. M.- I understand, but my question is, really, what makes it a dynamic, electronic wall mural, as cited in the proposal, is really not what the thing is being put on it mechanically. It's what the result of it is based upon the content or of what's being delivered. Is that fair?

H. Hallman - It is absolutely crucial, in the same way that paint could be applied to a canvas or applied to a house.

E. M.- I understand, but the thing that makes it a dynamic, electronic wall mural is the content of it, not the actual item that's being built onto the structure.

H. H.- Correct the content of what is being displayed is exactly the issue, and that is why we're before you, and not before the DRB with respect to some other kind of installation. This is an art installation, and that's why we're before Scottsdale Arts, as we agreed we would do under the development agreement, we put Scottsdale Arts with the city's participation and the former director as the participant in helping to design the content so that it would be art. Again, one can apply paint to a canvas or apply it to the outside of a house. That is the means by which one is rendering either art or painting a house. In this instance, we are using technology to render art.

E. M.- Is the content going to be subject to change, or is it going to be static content for the duration of the electronic projection?

H. H.- Well, as Valerie indicated, I have to answer that kind of more subtly. The idea is that this is, obviously, as you saw on the displays, a dynamic presentation. So as the city manager had requested, he wanted to see things like waterfalls and other displays that he's seen in other places. That's what this is to do, which to have movement within the display. But what those pieces are during their period of display is then determined based on our partnership here, so that you would have an array of things that could be displayed that Scottsdale Arts has had the opportunity to view, sign off, make suggestions, so that the things that are displayed can be changed over time. And there may come a time where, for example, in Canal Convergence, and other times when art is displayed elsewhere that we try to tie what's on this display to those things that are displayed at the canal. There are digital displays at the canal on regular occasion, the idea is to create the synergy in this intersection that we start really pushing greater implementation of art throughout and this particular district is intended to as the development agreement created an arts district that gives voice to that.

E. M. - Have you guys done any impact studies with the community in terms of either surveys or light projection studies or anything like that, to determine what a large light projection like this, how that would impact the community in terms of either what other residents and business owners may think of it, or how visible it will be from what distances and what sight lines, or anything like that. Has any of that been contemplated or commissioned?

H. H. - Well, it was certainly contemplated during the development of the project. This implementation is very far east of Scottsdale Road. So the surrounding quote community unquote is almost entirely owned by this particular developer. But I would correct something Valerie said of 24/7 in fact, the conceptions are that we need to work with the city staff to determine if there are any implications for anyone within the area that would have concerns that you're raising.

M.Schoettker - This is Miho. May I have a couple questions. I'm a board member. Tell me where is the major intersection? That's my first question.

B.O. - Scottsdale and Camelback is the major intersection arterial. This particular location is just east of Scottsdale Road, by two blocks off of Buckboard trail and just south of Camelback on Shoeman.

M.S. - Okay, so what is your plan for the operation? Is this 24/7?

H. H. - again, the idea is that once we get it installed, the city and Scottsdale Arts, to the extent you're interested, would participate in viewing it from various locations, but when you see where it actually is located, it's two blocks a full two blocks east of Scottsdale Road and two blocks south of Camelback. So it is buried within the commercial entertainment district that is not populated by any residential product. So suffice it to say that we've got about 30 properties within a two mile radius of this we've been here for a very long time. We have a lot of development ongoing. We have a lot of significant partnerships, strategic partnerships, with other businesses and residential owners in this area. It's in our best interest to maintain strong relationships with the community, and embracing them is certainly part of this, but step one is to make sure that we've got an application that Scottsdale Arts is comfortable with, so we can move in that direction.

M.S. Okay, so my comment is this, I'm a lighting designer, so we have a dark sky ordinance. This is not lighting. This is not straight lighting, or wall sconces on the building or anything like that. But we've got to be very, very careful about what you guys are projecting from the screen, in the daytime and the evening.

H. H. - And in fact, they are absolutely subjected to the dark skies ordinance. And so everything that is rendered has to take that into consideration.

M. S. - So when you project images, it's not like an image like what Scottsdale Public Art approves. What we approve is not like a moving art like you presented. So it's a very different subject for us.

H. H. - I don't know if I understand what you're saying,

M. S. - so what I'm saying is that, you know, we have applicants bring a sculpture, uh, wall art, it's painted or build a sculpture. It's not like moving images like the ones you presented. So I think Scottsdale Public Art, or City of Scottsdale, needs to see what you're planning to project on that surface of the building, the front of the building.

H. H. - So the reason you're involved is so that you can examine the images and determine what changes, if any, you would like to make as the Popper piece was presented to you. You are correct. This is not a static presentation, but that does not eliminate it from your opportunity to participate. The city processes also have to be complied with. But the Scottsdale Arts piece of this is merely about your curation of art and you're examining this art piece for its installation. The issues of dark skies ordinance, the issues of location, and other things are all within the jurisdiction of the city, not Scottsdale Arts, and we understand that. So that's why we're not really asking you for anything outside the jurisdiction of what Scottsdale Arts does, which is examine art and consider it.

J.M. - I guess, along those lines, can we just ask, in terms of the murals, how many would you see transitioning in a certain period, and what would your, I guess, process proposal be in changing those murals over time, how would you come back to the board for every time it was changing?
I guess, what were you guys thoughts on there? And additionally, is Ernest Roberts, would he be the only artist involved in drafting murals? Would you guys have other artists that would be involved, maybe speak a little bit to that?

H. H. - Yeah, all of those are great questions, and that gets to the heart of what will draw out a little bit, because it obviously went a little too fast. The idea is to create a series of performances. Let's say that may be another analogy to look at this, because you also consider performance instances given Scottsdale Center for the Arts and other things that that we would it makes the most sense to have the board consider the images as they're created that we would provide you with, a series of the displays that you would then consider and provide input on that would then create sort of our baseline vocabulary, but we can imagine that both Scottsdale Arts, the city, and other sources might ask for special application to allow this display to provide additional opportunities, as we discussed during Canal Convergence, there may be a reason to use an artist that's involved there and create a

special image that would be a dynamic image that would work with that particular installation. We are sensitive to the idea that Scottsdale Arts not be overwhelmed with frequent requests. So it really needs to be a series of things that come to you in one tranche, that you can review, provide comments, and that are then approved, that would go into the load, including we should consider together, how often should the displays change. You'll see the best example I give you yet again is in Chicago. There are faces on a very large installation, also subject to dark skies that change slowly over time. They're part of a water installation that again, in Centennial Park, you'll see in New York City, along the street, a number of these new installations, demonstrating waterfalls, cloud movement, things like that. And they do change over time. They're not the New York Times Square, kinds of bombastic, uh, advertising images. And then in terms of other artists, we have this artist who's creating the first tranche of images for us that you would then review and consider and provide input on. But the idea would be there may be other artists in Scottsdale or elsewhere that we all would like to invite to provide some input or additional images that could be added to the collection.

M.S. - So I understand, I understand what you're saying but the example, the cities you mentioned, were Chicago, New York. This is Scottsdale, Arizona. It's a bit different from these big, major cities so you know, we as board members, we get a little bit overwhelmed. For this application I'm not saying no or anything like that but we need to move a little slower than just pushing forward because we have never seen something like this. We have never approved anything like this. And we need to have a little more time to digest.

V.H. - I think you need to remember that this is a preliminary presentation about the concept. We do not have any imagery to show you, yet, it's still in development, and that's what this conversation is about.

K. Ballares - Valerie, do you have more slides in this presentation? I think we do have a couple more to go through.

V. H. - Yeah, just, basically the maintenance and the timeline. But as to the maintenance one, I think is up for you now, and so it is going to require routine, minimal maintenance and technical monitoring of the technology and screen cleaning, but otherwise the maintenance should be minimal.

H. H. - and it's all on the shoulders of the hotel operator.

V. H. - Yes.

J. Miller - Why don't you go through the rest of the slides, and then we'll see if we have any more questions for you. Go ahead.

V. H. - So as we said right now we're just at stage one review, which is just a preliminary plan, and then that will have to go to DRB for further review and approval. We hope to do that by September, and then we will come back to you in October, and at that point, we would have the kind of imagery you've been talking about today.

J. Sandino - Valerie, could I say something?

V.H. - Yes, please.

J.S. - Okay, so I'm sorry I'm overseas right now, but I have seen the installation in Chicago, and I've seen several overseas. And I think art doesn't have to be static. It can be alive. And I think it's a terrific idea. As an art consultant, I think it's perfect for what we need, as long as the community is considered and the amount of light that's admitted, I think it's a terrific idea. So I just wanted to put my two cents in.

B.O. - Thank you, thank you for that comment, and I would just expand that this is a great opportunity. We know it's a little outside the box, but it's a great opportunity for the private community to embrace the public art aspect of this and showcase just how important art is to the city of Scottsdale. So that's our goal. Is to embrace folks, make you, help you to understand what it is, what it's not, and then to co author what it becomes.

J.S. - I think it's terrific, because I think Scottsdale, it's about time that we are a little bit outside the box and come up to the altitude of the New York or Chicago's and other places around the world that have that kind of art, I think it's fantastic idea. Thank you.

V.H. - So then moving on, after stage two approval and review, we move on to fabrication and preparation in October and November, site installation in December and January, and then come back to you for a third time for approval when it's complete in January of 2025. The budget is about a quarter of a million dollars. And again, that's above and beyond the required contribution for this project.

H. H. - The goal being that Scottsdale Arts, today's activity is really to give us a green light to go forward with the efforts to design what the dynamic murals would look like, and bring those back to you for review and consideration. So this is the piece that the city has to do, the city has to do for Scottsdale Arts. It was this installation opportunity, it's what was contemplated in the development agreement and presented at DRB for location. And the need is to come back to Scottsdale Arts as we require. We put this in the development agreement. The council has already approved the concepts that are coming forward, but the specifics are absolutely in your jurisdiction to consider, and this stage is just about the direction the developer wants to head and will start designing those murals for your consideration. I would add that to the extent you have conceptions of what would be tied into Scottsdale that should be fed to Valerie, so that she can work with the artist to begin those initial conceptions, and then our bringing it to you at the next stage would be to help refine what's been created.

E.M. - what exactly did the council approve? And when?

H. H. - In December of 2020, the council approved that this district would have all kinds of unique efforts as they were considering moving this district into a stage that brings this area of Scottsdale into the international scene. And it was based on the original conceptions for the Galleria that never ultimately paid off. So that the council agreed that there would be shade enhancements that would be created landscape and hardscape enhancements, lighting enhancements, water plaza enhancements, and all of those would be, if I can read it to you, specifically that we would be applying recognized models for place-making focused on the introduction of art in unexpected, creative and unique ways to fuse each of these shade enhancements, landscape art enhancements, lighting enhancements, and water plant enhancements, with a level of art that established the hospitality district as a unique experiential neighborhood within the city. And all of that is defined as art enhancements that state that council then went on to say that the art enhancements, that's all of those things I just described, would be within the jurisdiction, ultimately that the hospitality district enhancements, which are all these art enhancements that incorporate art through shade, lighting, signage, landscape, and hardscaping, all of which are approved in this agreement, and the city's council specifically designates as artwork under the art code.

E.M. - So I'm asking specifically we have over here a dynamic, electronic wall mural. And my specific question is whether the City Council has already approved the installation of a dynamic electronic wall mural. I understand what we do is we evaluate things like content over here, because we're an art board, but from the standpoint of a dynamic electronic wall mural, is that something that the city council specifically has already approved?

H. H. - That was below the level of the development agreement and the zoning case. So instead, it was brought to as you saw in the drawings that Valerie presented to the DRB, where you see in their presentation materials, the locations of and I quote.....giving you the exact language from this document which was presented to the DRB.

E.M. I'm sorry, respectfully, I mean, we're trying to keep this meeting moving, and I'm just asking a very specific question was it approved by city council. It's either yes or no.

H.H. - The council approved what I read to you. The next step was to go to the DRB, and the DRB then was presented with slides that were called out as reflective of the zoning case that is by a city councilman statement. Why can't I find it? Boyce? Give me a second, then I can read for you the language in the DRB presentation, which location art, mural art media may include, but not limited to a wall art that is projected, illuminated, painted banners and etc. And those locations are in 1234567, locations on the building. So the process that the developers had to go through was a zoning case, then to the DRB, and the DRB approved these, these slides that then bring us to you, right?

V.H. - And you guys have copies of all of the collection, Master Plan and the DRB documents, they have all been provided as part of this submittal, so you have copies of all that with the approvals.

R.Grossman - I have a quick question, Valerie, when you were presenting and educating us what this is all about. Thank you for that. One of the things that you said was that the board, if you will, could be used to display whatever Scottsdale, you know, what Scottsdale is kind of promoting. I think you even referenced Canal Convergence. Can you educate a little bit more about what you were saying there?

V.H. - So I don't, I don't mean to suggest that it's a promotional vehicle, but it's a good vehicle for collaboration. And since Canal Convergence is such an important event for the public art program in the city, it would make sense, as we've alluded, that maybe an artist that's working on Canal Convergence is part of the program for what is projected at that particular time, if the program has another artist that somehow that linkage makes sense. I think, with advanced planning and again, defining how many times you change this and what you do, those are wonderful opportunities. I think it's an extremely exciting opportunity for collaboration. Does that answer the question?

R.G. - I think so. It just you guys kept, you know, saying was specifically a display of art, and then so that that confused me a little bit, as it as if it were some type of promotional display as well.

H. H. - You've got it exactly right, and it's a great question to make sure that we're fully on the record. But this is not intended to any way be a sign or promote products or promote events, provide, you know, banner like stuff that one would see on a in street signage or other banners the city uses to promote specific events.

R.G. - Okay, thank you. My only other question is, when you guys present something to us to review, will you have already done your work on the and approvals for if it was to have light..what's the word? I'm looking for, light pollution.

H.H. - Yeah, dark sky ordinance. So what will that compliance really will take place as part of the installation piece, because that's controlled by the level of light being admitted, and how it is shaded from interfering with the dark sky, provisions, and so all of that has to be addressed in connection with it. The timing of that is independent of your participation. And saying, let's put it this way. If this is erected, this is the stuff we think should be on it, and limiting the display to what passes through Scottsdale art as the array of things that you find acceptable.

R.G. - Sounds great. There's no other questions or comments I think. Thank you.

T.Galin - Yeah, thank you. Thank you for the presentation, and then we'll just take time I will let you know, or Kati will let you know after the board discusses the project.

B.B. - Thank you again for your time and consideration.